

**UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

---

In re:

CITY OF DETROIT, MICHIGAN,

Debtor.

---

)  
)  
)  
)  
)  
)  
)

Chapter 9

Case No. 13-53846

Hon. Steven W. Rhodes

**AMENDED NOTICE OF APPEAL**<sup>1</sup>

**PLEASE TAKE NOTICE THAT** The Michigan Council 25 of the American Federation of State, County & Municipal Employees, AFL-CIO and Sub-Chapter 98, City of Detroit Retirees (the AFSCME retiree chapter for City of Detroit retirees) (collectively, “**AFSCME**”) pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 158(a) and Rules 8001 and 8002(a) of the Federal Rules of Bankruptcy Procedure, files this **amended** notice of appeal to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Michigan from the bankruptcy court’s (i) decision, announced from the bench on December 3, 2013, finding the City of Detroit, Michigan eligible for relief under chapter 9 of the Bankruptcy Code (the “**Bench Decision**”); (ii) Order for Relief Under Chapter 9 of the Bankruptcy Code, dated December 5, 2013 finding the City of Detroit, Michigan eligible for relief under chapter 9 of the Bankruptcy Code [Docket No. 1946] (the “**Order for Relief**”); and (iii) accompanying Opinion Regarding Eligibility, dated December 5, 2013 [Docket No. 1945] (the “**Opinion**,” together with the Bench Decision and Order for Relief, are collectively the “**Eligibility Order**”).

This notice of appeal is timely filed pursuant to Federal Rule of Bankruptcy Procedure 8002(a). The names of the parties to the Eligibility Order appealed from and the names,

---

<sup>1</sup> This Amended Notice of Appeal is submitted pursuant to request of the Clerk’s office.

addresses, telephone and fax numbers of their respective attorneys are attached hereto as **“Exhibit A”**. A “Bankruptcy Matter Civil Cover Sheet” is attached hereto as **“Exhibit B”**.

Dated: December 6, 2013

**LOWENSTEIN SANDLER LLP**

By: /s/ Sharon L. Levine

Sharon L. Levine, Esq.

Philip J. Gross, Esq.

65 Livingston Avenue

Roseland, New Jersey 07068

(973) 597-2500 (Telephone)

(973) 597-6247 (Facsimile)

[slevine@lowenstein.com](mailto:slevine@lowenstein.com)

[pgross@lowenstein.com](mailto:pgross@lowenstein.com)

-and-

Herbert A. Sanders, Esq.

THE SANDERS LAW FIRM PC

615 Griswold St., Suite 913

Detroit, MI 48226

(313) 962-0099 (Telephone)

(313) 962-0044 (Facsimile)

[hsanders@miafscme.org](mailto:hsanders@miafscme.org)

-and-

Richard G. Mack, Jr., Esq.

Miller Cohen, P.L.C.

600 West Lafayette Boulevard

4<sup>th</sup> Floor

Detroit, MI 48226-3191

*Counsel to Michigan Council 25 of the American  
Federation of State, County and Municipal  
Employees (AFSCME), AFL-CIO and Sub-Chapter  
98, City of Detroit Retirees*

# **EXHIBIT A**

**Appellants**

**Michigan Council 25 of the American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees (AFSCME), AFL-CIO and Sub-Chapter 98, City of Detroit Retirees**

Represented by:

Sharon L. Levine, Esq.  
Philip J. Gross, Esq.  
LOWENSTEIN SANDLER LLP  
65 Livingston Avenue  
Roseland, New Jersey 07068  
(973) 597-2500 (Telephone)  
(973) 597-6247 (Facsimile)  
slevine@lowenstein.com  
pgross@lowenstein.com

-and-

Herbert A. Sanders, Esq.  
THE SANDERS LAW FIRM PC  
615 Griswold St., Suite 913  
Detroit, MI 48226  
(313) 962-0099 (Telephone)  
(313) 962-0044 (Facsimile)  
hsanders@miafscme.org

-and-

Richard G. Mack, Jr., Esq.  
Miller Cohen, P.L.C.  
600 West Lafayette Boulevard  
4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Detroit, MI 48226-3191

**Appellee**

**City of Detroit, Michigan**

Represented by:

David G. Heiman (OH 0038271)  
Heather Lennox (OH 0059649)  
JONES DAY  
North Point

901 Lakeside Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114  
Telephone: (216) 586-3939  
Facsimile: (216) 579-0212  
dgheiman@jonesday.com  
hlennox@jonesday.com

Bruce Bennett (CA 105430)  
JONES DAY  
555 South Flower Street  
Fiftieth Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90071  
Telephone: (213) 243-2382  
Facsimile: (213) 243-2539  
bbennett@jonesday.com

Thomas F. Cullen, Jr. (DC 224733)  
Gregory M. Shumaker (DC 416537)  
Geoffrey S. Stewart (DC 287979)  
JONES DAY  
51 Louisiana Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Telephone: (202) 879-3939  
Facsimile: (202) 626-1700  
tfcullen@jonesday.com  
gshumaker@jonesday.com  
gstewart@jonesday.com

MILLER, CANFIELD, PADDOCK AND STONE, P.L.C.  
Jonathan S. Green (MI P33140)  
Stephen S. LaPlante (MI P48063)  
150 West Jefferson  
Suite 2500  
Detroit, Michigan 48226  
Telephone: (313) 963-6420  
Facsimile: (313) 496-7500  
green@millercanfield.com  
laplante@millercanfield.com

**Other Interested Parties**

**The Police and Fire Retirement System of the City of Detroit  
The General Retirement System of the City of Detroit**

Represented by:

**CLARK HILL PLC**

Robert D. Gordon (P48627)  
Shannon L. Deeby (P60242)  
Jennifer K. Green (P69019)  
Evan J. Feldman (P73437)  
151 South Old Woodward Avenue  
Suite 200  
Birmingham, Michigan 48009  
Telephone: (248) 988-5882  
Facsimile: (248) 988-2502  
rgordon@clarkhill.com

**ARNOLD & PORTER LLP**

Lisa Hill Penning (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
777 South Figueroa Street  
44th Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90017  
Telephone: (213) 243-4000  
Facsimile: (213) 243-4199 lisa.fenning@aporter.com

**The Detroit Fire Fighters Association  
The Detroit Police Officers Association  
The Detroit Police Lieutenants & Sergeants Association  
The Detroit Police Command Officers Association**

Represented by:

**ERMAN, TEICHER, MILLER, ZUCKER & FREEDMAN, P.C.**

Earle I. Erman (P24296)  
Craig E. Zucker (P39907)  
Barbara A. Patek (P34666)  
400 Galleria Officentre, Suite 444  
Southfield, MI 48034  
Telephone: (249) 827-4100  
Facsimile: (248) 827-4106  
bpatek@ermanteicher.com

**International Union of Operating Engineers, Local 324**

Represented by:

SACHS WALDMAN, P.C.  
Andrew Nickelhoff (P37990)  
Mami Kato (P74237)  
2211 East Jefferson Avenue, Suite 200  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Telephone: (313) 496-9429  
Facsimile: (313) 965-4602  
anickelhoff@sachswaldman.com  
mkato@sachswaldman.com

**Service Employees International Union, Local 517M**

Represented by:

SACHS WALDMAN, P.C.  
Andrew Nickelhoff (P37990)  
Mami Kato (P74237)  
2211 East Jefferson Avenue, Suite 200  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Telephone: (313) 496-9429  
Facsimile: (313) 965-4602  
anickelhoff@sachswaldman.com  
mkato@sachswaldman.com

**David Sole**

Represented by:

JEROME D. GOLDBERG, PLLC  
Jerome D. Goldberg (P61678)  
2921 East Jefferson, Suite 205  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Telephone: (313) 393-6001  
Facsimile: (313) 393-6007  
apclawyer@sbcglobal.net

**The Retired Detroit Police & Fire Fighters Association**  
**Donald Taylor, individually and as President of the Retired Detroit Police & Fire Fighters Association**  
**The Detroit Retired City Employees Association**  
**Shirley V. Lightsey, individually and as President of the Detroit Retired City Employees Association**

Represented by:

LIPPITT O'KEEFE, PLLC  
Brian D. O'Keefe (P39603)  
Ryan C. Plecha (P71957)  
370 East Maple Road, 3rd Floor  
Birmingham, MI 48009  
Telephone: (248) 646-8292 rplecha@lippittokeefe.com

SILYERMAN & MORRIS, P.L.L.C.  
Thomas R. Morris (P39141)  
30500 Northwestern Highway, Suite 200  
Farmington Hills, MI 48334  
(248) 539-1330 morris@silvermanmorris.com

**Robbie Flowers, Michael Wells, Janet Whitson, Mary Washington and Bruce Goldman**

Represented by:

William A. Wertheimer (P26275)  
30515 Timberbrook Lane  
Bingham Farms, MI 48025  
Telephone: (248) 644-9200

**International Union, United Automobile, Aerospace and Agricultural Implement Workers of America**

Represented by:

COHEN, WEISS AND SIMON LLP  
Babette A. Ceccotti  
Keith E. Secular  
Thomas N. Ciantra  
Joshua J. Ellison  
330 West 42nd Street



New York, NY 10036  
Telephone: (212) 563-4100  
Facsimile: (212) 695-5436  
bceccotti@cwsny.com

Niraj R. Ganatra (P63150)  
Michael Nicholson (P33421)  
8000 East Jefferson Avenue  
Detroit, MI 48214  
Telephone: (313) 926-5216  
Facsimile: (313) 926-5240  
nganatra@uaw.net  
mnicholson@uaw.net

**Center for Community Justice and Advocacy**

Represented by:

VANESSA G. FLUKER, ESQ. PLLC  
Vanessa G. Fluker, Esq. PLLC  
2921 East Jefferson, Suite 200  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Telephone: (313) 393-6005  
Facsimile: (313) 393-6007  
vgflawyer@sbcglobal.net

**Retired Detroit Police Members Association**

Represented by:

STROBL & SHARP, P.C.  
Lynn M. Brimer (P43291)  
Meredith E. Taunt (P69698)  
Mallory A. Field (P75289)  
300 East Long Lake Road, Suite 200  
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304  
Telephone: (248) 540-2300  
Facsimile: (248) 645-2690 lbrimer@stroblpc.com  
mtaunt@stroblpc.com mfield@stroblpc.com

**Krystal Crittendon**

19737 Chesterfield  
Detroit, MI 48221

**The Retiree Committee of the City of Detroit**

Represented by:

**DENTONS US LLP**

Carole Neville  
1221 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, New York 10020  
Tel: (212) 768-6700  
Fax: (212) 768-6800  
carole.neville@dentons.com

**DENTONS US LLP**

Sam J. Alberts  
1301 K Street, NW Suite 600,  
East Tower Washington, DC 20005-3364  
Telephone: (202) 408-6400  
Facsimile: (202) 408-6399  
sam.alberts@dentons.com

**SALANS FMC SNR DENTON EUROPE LLP**

Claude D. Montgomery (P29212)  
Rockefeller Center  
620 Fifth Avenue  
New York, New York 10020  
Telephone: (212) 632-8390  
claudemontgomery@dentons.com

**BROOKS WILKINS SHARKEY & TURCO PLLC**

Matthew E. Wilkins (P56697)  
Paula A. Hall (P61101)  
401 South Old Woodward, Suite 400  
Birmingham, Michigan 48009  
Telephone: (248) 971-1711  
Facsimile: (248) 971-1801  
wilkins@bwst-law.com  
hall@bwst-law.com

# **EXHIBIT B**

**In re:**

City of Detroit, Michigan

**Case No.:** 13-53846

**Debtor.**

Michigan Council 25 of the American  
Federation of State, County and  
Municipal Employees (AFSCME),  
AFL-CIO and Sub-Chapter 98,  
City of Detroit Retirees  
**Appellants,**

**v.**

City of Detroit, Michigan  
**Appellee.**

**CAUSE OF ACTION/NATURE OF SUIT:** (This matter is referred to the district court for the following reasons)

<u>  x  </u>	[422] 28 U.S.C. 158	Bankruptcy Appeal
<u>  x  </u>	[422] 28 U.S.C. 158	Motion for Leave to Appeal
<u>      </u>	[423] 28 U.S.C. 157(d)	Motion for Withdrawal of Reference
<u>      </u>	[423] 28 U.S.C. 157(c) (1)	Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law
<u>      </u>	[423] 28 U.S.C. 158 (c) (a)	Order of Contempt

Dated: December 6, 2013

**LOWENSTEIN SANDLER LLP**

By: /s/ Sharon L. Levine

Sharon L. Levine, Esq.

Philip J. Gross, Esq.

65 Livingston Avenue

Roseland, New Jersey 07068

(973) 597-2500 (Telephone)

(973) 597-6247 (Facsimile)

[slevine@lowenstein.com](mailto:slevine@lowenstein.com)

[pgross@lowenstein.com](mailto:pgross@lowenstein.com)

-and-

Herbert A. Sanders, Esq.  
THE SANDERS LAW FIRM PC  
615 Griswold St., Suite 913  
Detroit, MI 48226  
(313) 962-0099 (Telephone)  
(313) 962-0044 (Facsimile)  
[hsanders@miafscme.org](mailto:hsanders@miafscme.org)

-and-

Richard G. Mack, Jr., Esq.  
Miller Cohen, P.L.C.  
600 West Lafayette Boulevard  
4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Detroit, MI 48226-3191

*Counsel to Michigan Council 25 of the American Federation  
of State, County and Municipal Employees (AFSCME), AFL-  
CIO and Sub-Chapter 98, City of Detroit Retirees*

**Name and Addresses of Interested Parties:**

**Appellants**

**Michigan Council 25 of the American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees (AFSCME), AFL-CIO and Sub-Chapter 98, City of Detroit Retirees**

Represented by:

Sharon L. Levine, Esq.  
Philip J. Gross, Esq.  
LOWENSTEIN SANDLER LLP  
65 Livingston Avenue  
Roseland, New Jersey 07068  
(973) 597-2500 (Telephone)  
(973) 597-6247 (Facsimile)  
slevine@lowenstein.com  
pgross@lowenstein.com

-and-

Herbert A. Sanders, Esq.  
THE SANDERS LAW FIRM PC  
615 Griswold St., Suite 913  
Detroit, MI 48226  
(313) 962-0099 (Telephone)  
(313) 962-0044 (Facsimile)  
hsanders@miafscme.org

-and-

Richard G. Mack, Jr., Esq.  
Miller Cohen, P.L.C.  
600 West Lafayette Boulevard  
4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Detroit, MI 48226-3191

**Appellee**

**City of Detroit, Michigan**

Represented by:

David G. Heiman (OH 0038271)  
Heather Lennox (OH 0059649)  
JONES DAY  
North Point

901 Lakeside Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114  
Telephone: (216) 586-3939  
Facsimile: (216) 579-0212  
dgheiman@jonesday.com  
hlennox@jonesday.com

Bruce Bennett (CA 105430)  
JONES DAY  
555 South Flower Street  
Fiftieth Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90071  
Telephone: (213) 243-2382  
Facsimile: (213) 243-2539  
bbennett@jonesday.com

Thomas F. Cullen, Jr. (DC 224733)  
Gregory M. Shumaker (DC 416537)  
Geoffrey S. Stewart (DC 287979)  
JONES DAY  
51 Louisiana Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Telephone: (202) 879-3939  
Facsimile: (202) 626-1700  
tfcullen@jonesday.com  
gshumaker@jonesday.com  
gstewart@jonesday.com

MILLER, CANFIELD, PADDOCK AND STONE, P.L.C.  
Jonathan S. Green (MI P33140)  
Stephen S. LaPlante (MI P48063)  
150 West Jefferson  
Suite 2500  
Detroit, Michigan 48226  
Telephone: (313) 963-6420  
Facsimile: (313) 496-7500  
green@millercanfield.com  
laplante@millercanfield.com

**Other Interested Parties**

**The Police and Fire Retirement System of the City of Detroit  
The General Retirement System of the City of Detroit**

Represented by:

**CLARK HILL PLC**

Robert D. Gordon (P48627)  
Shannon L. Deeby (P60242) Jennifer  
K. Green (P69019) Evan J. Feldman  
(P73437)  
151 South Old Woodward Avenue  
Suite 200  
Birmingham, Michigan 48009  
Telephone: (248) 988-5882  
Facsimile: (248) 988-2502  
rgordon@clarkhill.com

**ARNOLD & PORTER LLP**

Lisa Hill Penning (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
777 South Figueroa Street  
44th Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90017  
Telephone: (213) 243-4000  
Facsimile: (213) 243-4199 lisa.fenning@aporter.com

**The Detroit Fire Fighters Association  
The Detroit Police Officers Association  
The Detroit Police Lieutenants & Sergeants Association  
The Detroit Police Command Officers Association**

Represented by:

**ERMAN, TEICHER, MILLER, ZUCKER & FREEDMAN, P.C.**

Earle I. Erman (P24296)  
Craig E. Zucker (P39907)  
Barbara A. Patek (P34666)  
400 Galleria Officentre, Suite 444  
Southfield, MI 48034  
Telephone: (249) 827-4100  
Facsimile: (248) 827-4106  
bpatek@ermanteicher.com



## **International Union of Operating Engineers, Local 324**

Represented by:

SACHS WALDMAN, P.C.  
Andrew Nickelhoff (P37990)  
Mami Kato (P74237)  
2211 East Jefferson Avenue, Suite 200  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Telephone: (313) 496-9429  
Facsimile: (313) 965-4602  
anickelhoff@sachswaldman.com  
mkato@sachswaldman.com

## **Service Employees International Union, Local 517M**

Represented by:

SACHS WALDMAN, P.C. Andrew  
Nickelhoff (P37990) Mami Kato  
(P74237)  
2211 East Jefferson Avenue, Suite 200  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Telephone: (313) 496-9429  
Facsimile: (313) 965-4602  
anickelhoff@sachswaldman.com  
mkato@sachswaldman.com

## **David Sole**

Represented by:

JEROME D. GOLDBERG, PLLC  
Jerome D. Goldberg (P61678)  
2921 East Jefferson, Suite 205  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Telephone: (313) 393-6001  
Facsimile: (313) 393-6007  
apclawyer@sbcglobal.net

**The Retired Detroit Police & Fire Fighters Association**

**Donald Taylor, individually and as President of the Retired Detroit Police & Fire Fighters Association**

**The Detroit Retired City Employees Association**

**Shirley V. Lightsey, individually and as President of the Detroit Retired City Employees Association**

Represented by:

LIPPITT O'KEEFE, PLLC

Brian D. O'Keefe (P39603)

Ryan C. Plecha (P71957)

370 East Maple Road, 3rd Floor

Birmingham, MI 48009

Telephone: (248) 646-8292 rplecha@lippittokeefe.com

SILYERMAN & MORRIS, P.L.L.C.

Thomas R. Morris (P39141)

30500 Northwestern Highway, Suite 200

Farmington Hills, MI 48334

(248) 539-1330 morris@silvermanmorris.com

**Robbie Flowers, Michael Wells, Janet Whitson, Mary Washington and Bruce Goldman**

Represented by:

William A. Wertheimer (P26275)

30515 Timberbrook Lane

Bingham Farms, MI 48025

Telephone: (248) 644-9200

**International Union, United Automobile, Aerospace and Agricultural Implement Workers of America**

Represented by:

COHEN, WEISS AND SIMON LLP

Babette A. Ceccotti

Keith E. Secular

Thomas N. Ciantra

Joshua J. Ellison

330 West 42nd Street

New York, NY 10036

Telephone: (212) 563-4100  
Facsimile: (212) 695-5436  
bceccotti@cwsny.com

Niraj R. Ganatra (P63150)  
Michael Nicholson (P33421)  
8000 East Jefferson Avenue  
Detroit, MI 48214  
Telephone: (313) 926-5216  
Facsimile: (313) 926-5240  
nganatra@uaw.net  
mnicholson@uaw.net

### **Center for Community Justice and Advocacy**

Represented by:

VANESSA G. FLUKER, ESQ. PLLC  
Vanessa G. Fluker, Esq. PLLC  
2921 East Jefferson, Suite 200  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Telephone: (313) 393-6005  
Facsimile: (313) 393-6007  
vgflawyer@sbcglobal.net

### **Retired Detroit Police Members Association**

Represented by:

STROBL & SHARP, P.C.  
Lynn M. Brimer (P43291)  
Meredith E. Taunt (P69698)  
Mallory A. Field (P75289)  
300 East Long Lake Road, Suite 200  
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304  
Telephone: (248) 540-2300  
Facsimile: (248) 645-2690 lbrimer@stroblpc.com  
mtaunt@stroblpc.com mfield@stroblpc.com

**Krystal Crittendon**  
19737 Chesterfield  
Detroit, MI 48221

**The Retiree Committee of the City of Detroit**

Represented by:

**DENTONS US LLP**

Carole Neville  
1221 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, New York 10020  
Tel: (212) 768-6700  
Fax: (212) 768-6800  
carole.neville@dentons.com

**DENTONS US LLP**

Sam J. Alberts  
1301 K Street, NW Suite 600,  
East Tower Washington, DC 20005-3364  
Telephone: (202) 408-6400  
Facsimile: (202) 408-6399  
sam.alberts@dentons.com

**SALANS FMC SNR DENTON EUROPE LLP**

Claude D. Montgomery (P29212)  
Rockefeller Center  
620 Fifth Avenue  
New York, New York 10020  
Telephone: (212) 632-8390  
claudemontgomery@dentons.com

**BROOKS WILKINS SHARKEY & TURCO PLLC**

Matthew E. Wilkins (P56697)  
Paula A. Hall (P61101)  
401 South Old Woodward, Suite 400  
Birmingham, Michigan 48009  
Telephone: (248) 971-1711  
Facsimile: (248) 971-1801  
wilkins@bwst-law.com  
hall@bwst-law.com